UNITED STATES COURT OF FEDERAL CLAIMS

ISMAEL JOHN, et al.,	)	
	)	
Plaintiffs,	)	
	)	**No. 06-289L**
v.	)	
	)	**Hon. Christine O.C. Miller**
THE UNITED STATES,	)	
	)	
Defendant.	)	
	)	

THE UNITED STATES' MOTION TO DISMISS
AND MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT THEREOF

September 18, 2006

SUE ELLEN WOOLDRIDGE
Assistant Attorney General
Environment & Natural Resources Division

BRUCE K. TRAUBEN
Trial Attorney
Natural Resources Section
Environment & Natural Resources Division
United States Department of Justice
P.O. Box 663
Washington, D.C. 20044-0663
(202) 305-0238

Counsel for The United States

Of Counsel:

KATHRYN A. BLEECKER
Assistant Director
U.S. Department of Justice
Civil Division
Commercial Litigation Branch
1100 L Street, N.W., 8th Floor
Washington, D.C. 20530
(202) 307-6288

TABLE OF CONTENTS

MOTION TO DISMISS 1

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO DISMISS 1

I. NATURE OF THE CASE 1

II. STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES 2

III. STATEMENT OF THE CASE 3

A. U.S. Control over Enewetak Atoll and the Expulsion and Return of the Enewetak People 3

B. Political Control over Enewetak and the Compact of Free Association 5

C. Prior Litigation 8

D. Proceedings before the Nuclear Claims Tribunal 9

E. The Changed Circumstances Request and Political Solution 10

IV. ARGUMENT 12

A. Introduction 12

B. Standard of Review 13

C. This Action Must Be Dismissed for Lack of Jurisdiction Pursuant to the Compact Act and Section 177 Agreement 14

1. Plaintiffs Cannot Meet Their Burden of Establishing the Court's Subject Matter Jurisdiction 15

2. Plaintiffs Are Barred by the Doctrine of Res Judicata from Relitigating this Issue 18

D. This Action Raises a Nonjusticiable Political Question and Must Be Dismissed 20

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES

Adams v. United States,
391 F.3d 1212 (Fed. Cir. 2004) 33

Advanced Cardiovascular Sys., Inc. v. SciMed Life Sys., Inc.,
988 F.2d 1157 (Fed. Cir. 1993) 14

Alliance of Descendants of Texas Land Grants v. United States,
37 F.3d 1478 (Fed. Cir. 1994) 30, 31, 36

Am. Pelagic Fishing Co., L.P. v. United States,
379 F.3d 1363 (Fed. Cir. 2004) 33

Antolok v. United States,
873 F.2d 369 (D.C. Cir. 1989) ..... passim

Applegate v. United States,
35 Fed.Cl. 406 (1996) 33

Baker v. Carr,
369 U.S. 186 (1962) ..... 12, 21, 22 , 24 , 25

Banco Nacional de Cuba v. Sabbatino,
376 U.S. 398 (1964) 35

Blaze Constr., Inc. v. United States,
27 Fed.Cl. 646 (1993) 14, 32

Blue v. United States,
21 Cl.Ct. 359 (1990) 33

Briscoe v. LaHue,
663 F.2d 713 (7th Cir. 1981) 14, 36

Cedars-Sinai Med. Ctr. v. Watkins,
11 F.3d 1573 (Fed. Cir. 1993) 13

City of El Centro v. United States,
922 F.2d 816 (Fed. Cir. 1990) 31, 36